

FACTORS IMPACTING THE EFFECTIVE CITIZENSHIP VALUES OF SECONDARY SCHOOL STUDENTS WITHIN THE SCOPE OF SOCIAL STUDIES EDUCATION

**Elif Alkar, Tolga Kara
Prof. Dr. Emin Atasoy**

Bursa Uludag University (Turkey)

Abstract. In this study, it was aimed to identify the factors impacting the effective citizenship values of secondary school students within the scope of social studies education. The research data were collected from 5 different secondary schools located in the province of Kocaeli in Turkey in the fall semester of 2020-2021 academic year. Participants of the study were a total of 905 students, 481 of whom were females and 424 of them were males. In this study carried out in the scanning design as a descriptive study, the effect of students' grade level, gender, education level of their parents, monthly income of the family, frequency of following the news and being a member of a non-governmental organization on the effective citizenship values were tried to be identified. The study is the first international research to determine the effective citizenship value levels of Secondary School students within the scope of social studies education.

Keywords: secondary school students; social studies education; citizenship; effective citizenship; citizenship education, value

Introduction

The citizen model desired by the sovereign power (state) whereby the individual adapts to the society and political order is possible with citizenship education (Safran 2008). In particular, the concept of efficient (active, effective) citizenship, which we have frequently encountered recently, is accepted as an approach with the universal subject area (Hablemitoglu & Ozmete 2012).

The citizenship education applied by the countries may vary depending on the political situation and historical roots of the country (Altintas & Karaaslan 2019). When evaluated within the scope of the education program, the students in these countries are helped to gain the necessary knowledge and skills through social studies course in order to be good citizens¹⁾ (Ozturk 2009; Kus & Aksu 2017). The United States, Australia, Canada and Turkey are the examples of such countries.

Social studies, which has an interdisciplinary content related to social sciences, is accepted as a program suitable for the acquisitions for the countries aiming for effective citizenship. It deals with social studies education, social sciences and citizenship subjects with a multidisciplinary perspective and aims to materialize the social existence of individuals.

The acquisitions targeted in line with this purpose are to train active individuals who have high awareness of both themselves and their environment, are aware of their responsibilities, prioritize and protect the interests of the country they live in (Cevik Kansu 2015, 22).

The values defined as the principles we use as right and wrong in training the effective citizen model are of great importance (Bee 2017). It is possible for the decisions in our judgments to proceed more accurately against social or individual events thanks to values education. In Aristotles' words, values education helps people to be able to perform all activities specific to human beings in accordance with their goals (Kucuradi 1995; Ulusoy & Dilmac 2012).

The present study aims to identify the factors that determine the levels of effective citizenship values among the secondary school students. The study is important in that it includes a process for factors affecting the effective citizenship values of secondary school students. Secondary school students are more willing to participate in the activities related to the values education and adopt these values. Therefore, this period is considered critical for students' value acquisition (Caliskan & Saglam 2012).

In the present study, it was attempted to identify the effect of demographic characteristics of secondary school students on their effective citizenship levels. In the relevant literature, it is possible to come across different studies that determine the value orientation and citizenship level of students and teachers regarding the study (Durualp 2016; Yilmaz 2013; Polat & Caliskan 2013; Evin & Varol 2004). Nevertheless, no national or international study was found that identify the effective citizenship value levels of secondary school students within the scope of social studies education. The study, in this respect, is the first of its kind.

Within the scope of the study, answers to the following questions were sought;

1. Do the secondary school students' effective citizenship values differ by their grade levels?
2. Do the secondary school students' effective citizenship values differ by gender?
3. Do the secondary school students' effective citizenship values differ according to the education level of their mothers?
4. Do the secondary school students' effective citizenship values differ according to the education level of their fathers?
5. Do the secondary school students' effective citizenship values differ according to the monthly income of the families?

6. Do the secondary school students' effective citizenship values differ according to their frequency of following the news?

7. Do the effective citizenship values of secondary school students differ according to their membership in any non-governmental organization?

Method

In this study, the quantitative research method was used. In the present study, in order to test the related assumptions, the scanning pattern, a descriptive method, was used (Pallant 2020). Scanning pattern is the quantitative or numerical determination of trends, attitudes or views across the universe by studies conducted on the sample selected within the universe (Creswell 2017; Karasar 2007). Accordingly, it was tried to determine the effect of secondary school students' grade level, gender, level of their parents' education, monthly income of their family, frequency of following the news, and membership of any non-governmental organization on effective citizenship values.

The Study Group

The study group consisted of students selected from five different secondary schools in the province of Kocaeli in Turkey in the 2020-2021 academic year. A total of 958 students from the 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th grades participated in the study; however, the responses of 905 students were used since the personal information form and the scale were either filled incompletely or answered erroneously. 481 of the participants in the study were female and 424 were male students.

Data Collection Tools

In this study, "Personal Information Form" and "Effective Citizenship Values Scale" were used as data collection tools.

Personal Information Form

In the personal information form created by the researchers, in order to determine the demographic characteristics of the secondary school students, the questions of the students' grade level, gender, education level of the parents, monthly income of the families, the frequency of students following the news and whether they were a member of a non-governmental organization were included. Moreover, the students were asked to indicate the non-governmental organizations they were members of.

Effective Citizenship Values Scale (ECVS)

Another data collection tool in the study was the scale of effective citizenship values. The scale developed by Caliskan and Yildirim (2020) consists of five sub-dimensions. These sub dimensions are; "*Benevolence*", "*Love*", "*Respect*", "*Righteousness-Honesty*", "*Fairness*" and "*Responsibility*". The scale consisted of 82 items in total and was arranged in a 5-point Likert format. The scale was answered by the participants as "Not at all suitable (1)", "Not suitable" (2),

“Somewhat suitable (3)”, “Suitable (4)”, “Completely suitable (5)”. Cronbach Alpha reliability coefficients calculated as a result of the reliability studies were found as benevolence .79, love .77, respect .79, righteousness-honesty .74, fairness .76, responsibility and .95 for the whole scale. These values were found sufficient for reliability.

Data Collection

The implementation of the personal information available in the form of study and active citizenship values scale was conducted in five different secondary schools of the Ministry of Education in the province of Kocaeli in Turkey in the fall semester of 2020 – 2021 academic year. For the scale, approval of the ethics committee and the permission of the Ministry of Education were also obtained from the relevant institutions. The scale was created on the “Google Online Form” and applied by sending to the e-mail addresses of the students. The effective citizenship values scale and personal information form were analyzed in line with the complete answers received from the total of 905 students.

Data Analysis

The Statistical Package for the Social Sciences (SPSS) program was used to analyze the study data. Frequency, percentage and arithmetic mean were used in the analysis of the data, and independent t-test was used for comparison between groups. One-way analysis of variance (Anova) was used to compare groups with more than two. Tukey HSD test (PostHoc) was used in order to determine which groups created the statistical difference that emerged in the paired comparisons after the variance analysis. In the statistical analysis of the scale, the level of significance was accepted as .05. The skewness and kurtosis levels of the relevant variables were examined and it was found that these values ranged from -1 to +1. It is possible to say that these values had a normal distribution (George, 2011; Hair, Black, & Babin, 2014; Morgan, Barrett, Leech, & Gloeckner 2019).

Results

In this section, the results of the analysis regarding whether the effective citizenship values of the students differed according to the variables of class, gender, education level of the parents, monthly income of the families, frequency of following the news and being a member of a non-governmental organization are available.

Sub-Dimensions of the Effective Citizenship Values Scale

The arithmetic average and standard deviation values taken by secondary school students from the sub-dimensions of the effective citizenship scale are included in Table 1.

Table 1. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation values according to the sub-dimensions of the effective citizenship values scale

Sub-Dimensions	N	X	Ss
Benevolence	905	4,402	,448
Love	905	4,254	,450
Respect	905	4,459	,443
Righteousness-Honesty	905	4,352	,472
Fairness	905	4,249	,393
Responsibility	905	4,109	,528

When Table 1 is examined, it is seen that the highest average among the dimensions belonged to the “respect” sub-dimension ($X = 4,459$). The lowest average score in the scale belonged to the “responsibility” sub-dimension ($X = 4.109$). According to this result, it is possible to say that the respect value of the students was higher than the values in the other sub-dimensions.

Grade Level

The arithmetic mean and standard deviation values related to the mean scores of the secondary school students participating in the study from the scale of effective citizenship values according to their grade levels are illustrated in Table 2.

Table 2. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation values of the mean scores of effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to their grade level

Grade Level	N	X	Ss
5 th sınıf	242	4,398	,385
6 th sınıf	206	4,302	,376
7 th sınıf	202	4,239	,408
8 th sınıf	255	4,268	,363

As it is seen in Table 2, the highest average of 5th grade students ($X = 4,398$) and the lowest average belonged to 8th grade students in terms of effective citizenship values according to their grade levels (4,268). In addition, it was observed that the variances of the data obtained from the effective citizenship scale according to the grade level by using the Levene test were homogeneous ($LF = 7,566$, $p < .05$). One-way analysis of variance was performed to test whether the arithmetic means were statistically different between the groups.

One-way analysis of variance results regarding the average point averages of the effective citizenship values according to the grade levels of the students are given in Table 3.

Table 3. One-way analysis of variance results for secondary school students' mean scores for effective citizenship values according to their grade levels

Variance Source	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Average of Squares	F	p	Significant Difference
Inter-group	3,326	3	1,109	7,566	,000	(5-6),(5-7), (5-8)
Intra-group	132,033	902	,147			
Total	135,360	905				

$p < 0,05$

Table 3 illustrates the findings on the comparison of the students' effective citizenship values score averages according to the grade level variable. According to the findings, the effective citizenship values of the students showed a significant difference according to their grade status ($F(905) = 7,566$ $p < .05$). This difference is in favor of 5th grade students. According to this result, it is possible to say that 5th grade students' effective citizenship values are higher than all other grade levels.

Gender

The arithmetic mean and standard deviation values of the average scores of the middle school students participating in the study from the effective citizenship value scale according to the gender variable were calculated and the difference between the means was tested with the t-test. The results of the t-test regarding the effective citizenship values of the students according to their gender are shown in Table 4.

Table 4. T-test results regarding the effective citizenship values of secondary school students by gender

Gender	N	X	SS	SD	t	p
Female	481	4,349	,373	902	3,720	,000
Male	424	4,254	,396			

$p < 0.05$

According to the results of the independent t-test in Table 4, the effective citizenship values of male and female students differed ($p < .05$). Considering the mean scores obtained from the Effective citizenship values scale, it was found

that the effective citizenship values of female students ($X = 4.349$) were higher than the male students' mean scores ($X = 4.254$). According to the results of the independent t-test, the levels of effective citizenship values of male and female students differed ($p < .05$). According to these findings, it is possible to say that female students' effective citizenship values were higher than the male students. In the study, the effective citizenship scores of the students were compared in subcategories according to the gender variable. Descriptive statistics for sub-dimensions are included in Table 5.

Table 5. Results on the sub-dimensions of the effective citizenship values scale by gender of secondary school students

Sub-Dimensions	Cinsiyet	N	X	Ss	Sd	t	p
Benevolence	Female	481	4,423	,431	902	1,477	,140
	Male	424	4,379	,466			
Love	Female	481	4,282	,438	902	1,990	,047
	Male	424	4,223	,461			
Respect	Female	481	4,519	,422	902	4,408	,000
	Male	424	4,390	457			
Righteousness-Honesty	Female	481	4,397	,442	902	3,045	,002
	Male	424	4,302	,500			
Fairness	Female	481	4,288	,384	902	3,081	,002
	Male	424	4,207	,400			
Responsibility	Female	481	4,186	,521	902	4,684	,000
	Male	424	4,023	,524			

Looking at the mean scores in Table 5, it was found that the mean scores of female students in all sub-dimensions were higher than the male students. Accordingly, it is possible to say that the sub-dimensions of the scale of effective citizenship values between the male and female students exhibited a significant difference in favor of females.

Education Level of the Mothers

The arithmetic mean and standard deviation values regarding the mean scores of the secondary school students participating in the study from the effective citizenship value scale according to their mothers' education levels are illustrated in Table 6.

Table 6. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation values for secondary school students' mean scores of effective citizenship values according to mothers' education level

Education Level of the Mothers	N	X	Ss
Nonliterate	8	4,222	,584
Literate (Non-graduate)	22	4,209	,459
Elementary Education and Equivalent	257	4,296	,375
High School and Equivalent	368	4,295	,387
Academy/Faculty	239	4,339	,380
Master's / Doctoral Degree	11	4,287	,478

When Table 6 is examined, it is seen that the highest average score belonged to the students who answered as “Academy/Faculty” ($X = 4,339$). The lowest average belonged to students with the answer “Literate (Non-graduate)” ($X = 4,209$). On the other hand, as a result of the Levene test, it was observed that the variances of the data were homogeneous ($LF = 797, p > 0.05$). The significance of the difference between the groups was tested with one-way analysis of variance and the results are illustrated in Table 7.

Table 7. The results of one-way analysis of variance regarding the average point average of effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to mother's education level

Variance Source	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Average of Squares	F	P
Inter-group	,597	6	,119	,797	,552
Intra-group	134,762	899	,150		
Total	135,360	905			

$p > 0.05$

When Table 7 is analyzed, it was found that there was no significant difference between the students' effective citizenship value point averages and the education level of their mothers. ($F(905) = ,797; p > 0.05$). Based on this result, it is possible to say that the maternal education status of the students did not affect their effective citizenship levels.

Education Level of the Fathers

The arithmetic mean and standard deviation values regarding the mean scores of the secondary school students participating in the study from the effective

citizenship value scale according to their fathers' education levels are illustrated in Table 8.

Table 8. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation values for secondary school students' mean scores of effective citizenship values according to their fathers' education level

Education Level of the Fathers	N	X	Ss
Nonliterate	3	3,759	,704
Literate (Non-graduate)	20	4,122	,516
Elementary Education and Equivalent	161	4,251	,389
High School and Equivalent	387	4,342	,371
Academy/Faculty	304	4,309	,375
Master's / Doctoral Degree	30	4,223	,468

When Table 8 is examined, it is seen that the highest average belonged to the students who gave the answer "Nonliterate" ($X = 4,759$). The lowest average belonged to students with the answer "Literate (Non-graduate)" ($X = 4.112$). On the other hand, it was observed that the variances of the data obtained as a result of the Levene test were homogeneous ($LF = 3.768, p < 0.05$).

The significance of the difference between effective citizenship score averages according to the fathers' education level was tested with one-way analysis of variance and the results are shown in Table 9.

Table 9. One-way analysis of variance results regarding the average point average of effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to fathers' education

Variance Source	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Average of Squares	F	p
Inter-group	2,778	6	,556	3,768	,002
Intra-group	132,581	899	,147		
Total	135,360	905			

$p < 0.05$

When Table 9 is examined, it is seen that the mean scores of effective citizenship values of the students made a significant difference according to the education level of their fathers ($F(905) = 3,768; p < 0.05$). In other words, the educational status of the father made a significant difference in the effective citizenship values of the students.

Family's monthly income

The average scores of secondary school students from the scale of effective citizenship values according to the income levels of their families were analyzed. The arithmetic mean and standard deviation values for the average points of effective citizenship value according to the monthly income levels of the families of the students participating in the study are presented in Table 10.

Table 10. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation values for secondary school students' average point of effective citizenship value according to the income level of their families

Monthly income	N	X	Ss
Less than 2000 TL	68	4,245	,432
Between 2000-4000 TL	329	4,310	,369
Between 4000-7000 TL	340	4,303	,383
More than 7000 TL	168	4,318	,408

When Table 10 is examined, it is seen that the highest average belonged to the students who answered as “more than 7000 TL” ($X = 4,318$). The lowest average belonged to students who answer “less than 2000 TL” ($X = 4,245$). On the other hand, as a result of the Levene test, it was seen that the variances of the data were homogeneous ($LF =, 628, p > 0.05$).

The significance of the difference between their families' monthly income levels, effective citizenship values, score averages, was tested with one-way variance analysis and the results are shown in Table 11.

Table 11. The results of one-way analysis of variance regarding the average point average of effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to the income level of their families

Variance Source	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Average of Squares	F	p
Inter-group	,282	3	,094	,628	,597
Intra-group	135,077	902	,150		
Total	135,360	905			

$p > 0.05$

According to Table 11, the effective citizenship value score averages of the students did not differ significantly according to the monthly income levels of their families ($F(905) =, 628; p > 0.05$). In other words, no significant difference was found on the effective citizenship values of the monthly income of the students' families.

Frequency of Following the News

The effect of secondary school students' frequency of following the news on effective citizenship values was examined and presented in Table 12.

Table 12. Arithmetic mean and standard deviation values regarding effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to their frequency of following the news

Frequency of Following the News	N	X	Ss
Everyday	415	4,323	,384
Every few days	311	4,315	,384
Once a week	74	4,320	,380
Once a month	28	4,139	,416
Never follow the news	77	4,193	,381

When Table 12 is examined, it is seen that the highest average belonged to the students who gave the answer “I follow the news every day” ($X = 4,323$). The lowest average belonged to students who said “I follow the news once a month” (4,139). In addition, as a result of the Levene test, it was observed that the variance was homogeneous ($LF = 3.289$, $p < 0.05$). The significance of the difference between the effective citizenship level score averages according to the frequency of following the news was tested with one-way analysis of variance and the results are shown in Table 13.

Table 13. Results of one-way analysis of variance regarding the average point average of effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to the frequency of following the news

Variance Source	Sum of Squares	Degree of Freedom	Average of Squares	F	p
Inter-group	1,950	4	,488	3,289	,011
Intra-group	133,410	901	,148		
Total	135,360	905			

$p < 0.05$

According to Table 13, the average point average of effective citizenship value of the students exhibited a significant difference according to the frequency of following the news ($F(905) = 3,289$; $p > 0.05$). In other words, students who had a high frequency of following the news had a higher level of effective citizenship.

Non-governmental Organization Membership

The effect of secondary school students' membership to any non-governmental organization on effective citizenship values was examined according to the sub-dimensions of the scale and is illustrated in Table 14.

Table 14. T-test results regarding effective citizenship values of secondary school students according to their membership in a non-governmental organization

Sub-Dimensions	Member/ Non-member	N	X	SS	SD	t	P
Benevolence	Member	114	4,439	,477	903	,929	,353
	Non-member	791	4,397	,444			
Love	Member	114	4,369	,422	903	2,938	,003
	Non-member	791	4,237	,451			
Respect	Member	114	4,549	,397	903	2,347	,019
	Non-member	791	4,446	,448			
Righteousness-Honesty	Member	114	4,418	,468	903	1,591	,112
	Non-member	791	4,343	,472			
Fairness	Member	114	4,302	,392	903	1,524	,128
	Non-member	791	4,242	,393			
Responsibility	Member	114	4,197	,559	903	1,905	,057
	Non-member	791	4,068	,523			

According to Table 14, there was a significant difference between the effective citizenship value score averages of the students in favor of the students who were members of any non-governmental organization ($p < .05$). The mean scores of the effective citizenship values scale were higher in the sub-dimensions of love, respect, righteousness-honesty, fairness and responsibility, compared to students who were members of a non-governmental organization.

Accordingly, active citizenship levels differed from students who were members of non-governmental organizations compared to students who were not. In the study, that the students were asked about the non-governmental organizations they were a member of and the answers are illustrated in Table 15.

Table 15. The non-governmental organizations that secondary school students are members of Non-governmental organizations

Non-governmental organizations	F	%
Tema	94	93
Losev	3	3
Kizilay	2	2
MAG	2	2
Total	101	100

When Table 15 is examined, it is seen that 101 out of 905 students participating in the study were members of at least one of the non-governmental organizations. Total number of 94 participants members stated that they were member of TEMA (Foundation Combating Soil Erosion, Reforestation and Protection of Natural Resources in Turkey) 3 participants members of LOSEV (Children's Leukemia Foundation) 2 participants members of Turkish Red Crescent Foundation and 2 participants members of MAG (Neighborhood Disaster Volunteers). The low number of students who were members of non-governmental organizations according to the total number of participants in the study is also conspicuous.

Discussion and conclusion

Citizenship competencies, which are emphasized in the citizenship education, incapsulates a field that includes a kind of political literacy of students, such as students' knowledge of social, political and civil institutions and human rights, recognition of cultural and historical heritage.

Many studies in the literature demonstrate that the quality of democratic governance depend on the citizens' civic virtues and participation (Almond & Verba 1963; Putnam 1993). In their study on the level of active citizenship in different countries, Steenekamp & Loubser (2016) stated that Turkey exhibited low levels of active citizenship; this is especially true for participation at the civil society and society level.

Moreover, there are studies indicating that in the relationship between the concepts that meet effective citizenship and other social and economic indicators, the level of effective citizenship especially between countries differs and the social life outside the school has an impact on effective citizenship (Hoskins et al. 2006; Hofstede 1991; Scheerens 2011). Benn (2000) stated that many social factors such as citizenship, poverty, poor health conditions, gender, race or age affected active participation in individuals. These findings are conspicuous in that they are similar to the demographic results in our study.

The active citizenship perception has long been impacted by today's strong state tradition in Turkey. Considering the studies aimed at investigating an active citizenship in Turkey, it is seen that the studies have mostly focused on teachers, teacher candidates and students (Cincil 2020; Sener 2019; Degirmenci 2019; Arcanli 2019; Caliskan and Yildirim 2020; Eryilmaz 2019; Cevik Kansu 2015; Ersoy 2014). In those related studies, Sener (2019), for instance, stated that students established relationships with the concepts of law, freedom, equality, land, rights and equality regarding the concept of active citizenship, while Cincil (2020) stated that students' perceptions of supporting non-governmental organizations as an active citizen were positive. Cakmakli (2015) stated that participation in non-governmental organizations provided a learning environment that could develop effective citizenship practices in terms of strengthening the self-confidence of the individual, making them more active and directing them to question and criticize the actions and decisions related to them.

In this study, according to the findings of the effective citizenship values scale applied to the secondary school students, the sub-dimensions of the scale was examined first. It is seen that the highest average score obtained from the students in these dimensions, divided into benevolence, love, respect, righteousness-honesty, fairness and responsibility, belonged to the sub-dimension of “respect”. Morris and Cogan (2001) stated in their study that in Hong Kong, Taiwan and Thailand, the concept of citizenship was mostly based on the value of “common goodness”. Ersoy (2012), on the other hand, emphasized that children in the family were raised with social values such as honesty, responsibility, respect and loyalty to the nation which were the traits of good citizenship. We can list the results obtained according to the variables of the study as follows.

Considering the effective citizenship values levels of the students according to the grade variable, it is seen that there was a significant difference between the grades. This difference between grades was in favor of 5th grade students. It is a striking result that the average scores of 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th grade students on the scale of effective citizenship values decreased as their grade level increased. When the effective citizenship values levels of the students according to the class variable were examined, clearly, there was a significant difference between the classes. This difference between classes was in favor of 5th grade students. It is a striking result that the average scores of 5th, 6th, 7th and 8th grade students on the scale of effective citizenship values decreased as their grade level increased. Similarly, Saracaloglu, Evin and Varol (2004), stated that the democratic attitude of teacher candidates differed according to the age level, and as the age level of the students increased, their existing democratic attitudes decreased.

Regarding the gender variable, there was a significant difference in favor of females in the whole and sub-dimensions of the effective citizenship values scale between the male and female students. There were different studies concluding that female students’ perception of democratic attitude and citizenship was higher than that of males (Durualp 2016; Saracaloglu, Evin, & Varol 2004). Polat and Caliskan (2013) who investigated the value orientations regarding the gender variable stated that benevolence value orientation was higher in female students. In his study with 8th graders, Yilmaz (2013) stated that especially the responsibility value of female students was higher than the male students. Sociologically based research emphasizes that the roles assigned to gender determine the opportunities and styles of individuals to participate in society, and that there are responsibilities and values imposed on women and men according to the age period in their lives (Mead 1934; Evrim 1972; Vatandas 2007). Among these responsibilities and values, it is seen that values such as benevolence, respect, and citizenship perception are higher in females compared to males. Similarly, Schwartz (1994) and Shaw (2005) stated that the upbringing of the individual affected the value judgments and the geographical location and the structure of the society had an impact on education.

In the present study, it was concluded that the education level of the mothers did not make a significant difference in the effective citizenship values of the students,

but that the fathers' education level made significant differences on the effective citizenship value. However, there are results available in the literature indicating that the education level of the mothers is effective on the perception of democratic citizenship. In his study examining the secondary school students' perception of citizenship, Durualp (2016) stated that students with mothers who had higher education possessed a higher perception of democratic citizenship.

The variable of family' monthly income did not make a significant difference in the effective citizenship value level of the students. Durualp (2016) stated that there were results indicating that family income demonstrated a significant difference in students' perception of democratic citizenship.

There was a significant difference in the effective citizenship value regarding the frequency of students' following the news. In her study on pre-service teachers, Yazgan (2013) emphasized that there was a significant relationship between the active citizenship and democratic values of students with high media literacy levels who read books, magazines, newspapers and followed the news.

Students' effective citizenship values differed significantly in favor of students who were members of any non-governmental organization. Even though there was a high number of students participating in the study (905), it is seen that a very small number (101) were members of non-governmental organizations. The students mostly stated that they were a member of TEMA foundation. In another study conducted by Demirhan (2018) on 6th grade students on the same subject, it was stated that the non-governmental organizations that students knew were Kizilay, Yesilay, TEMA, LOSEV, TEV, MEV, and students had a positive perception of being a member of non-governmental organizations.

Consequently, the citizenship education prepares people to be actively and effectively involved in the administrations of their own states. The citizenship competencies and values that come to the fore in this preparation process are implemented and shaped by the formal and informal learning experiences (Maslowski, Breit, Eckensberger & Scheerens 2009). In formal education institutions, students are expected to develop respect for themselves and others in order to achieve mutual understanding.

At this point, effective citizenship has emerged primarily on the basis of human relations, as it indicated the democratic social participation that requires respect for the rights of other individuals. Individuals can acquire relevant citizenship competencies, especially through social participation.

As a result of the findings obtained in our study, it is seen that the effective citizenship values of secondary school students were not evenly distributed on the basis of class and gender. Furthermore, it is observed that the monthly income of the family and the education level of the fathers, the frequency of students following the news and their membership in a non-governmental organization were the effective citizenship values, while no meaningful results were obtained regarding the education level of the mothers.

Suggestions

1. This study that was carried out in the Kocaeli province of Turkey can be more comprehensively carried out in different cities of the country as well.
2. Qualitative studies can be conducted on effective citizenship values with groups of participants selected from different regions or countries.
3. In the present study, it was clearly observed that the non-governmental organization to which the secondary school students were members was at a very low level. For this reason, students can be given more information about non-governmental organizations and their activities in social studies courses and the opportunity to participate in the practices of these organizations can be offered.

NOTES

1. NCSS, 1994. *Expectations of Excellence: Curriculum Standards for The Social Studies*. Washington.
2. NCSS, 2005. *Curriculum Standards for Social Studies: I. Introduction*. Washington.

REFERENCES

- Almond, G. & Verba, S., 1963. *Civic Culture*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Altintas, İ. N. & Karaaslan, H., 2019. Study on Effective Citizenship Education and It's Dimensions. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 7(7), 1567 – 1579.
- Arcanli, C. 2019. *The Social Sciences Teachers and Prospective Teachers Opinions on The Field of Effective Citizenship Learning*. Firat: Firat University [In Turkish].
- Bee, C., 2017. *Active Citizenship in Turkey in Active Citizenship in Europe*. London: Palgrave Macmillan [In Turkish].
- Benn, R., 2000. The Genesis of Active Citizenship in The Learning Society. *Studies in The Education of Adults*, 32(2), 241 – 256.
- Cincil, F., 2020. *Determination of Effective Citizenship Perceptions of Students with Vignettes Prepared About Non Governmental Organizations*. Trabzon: Trabzon University [In Turkish].
- Creswell, J. W., 2017. *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches* Ankara: Egiten Book.
- Cakmakli, D., 2015. Active Citizenship in Turkey: Learning Citizenship in Civil Society Organizations. *Citizenship Studies*, 19(3 – 4), 421 – 435.
- Caliskan, H., & Saglam, H. İ., 2012. A Study on The Development of The Tendency to Tolerance Scale and an Analysis of The Tendencies of Primary

- School Students to Tolerance Through Certain Variables. *Journal of Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*. **12**(2), 1431 – 1446. [In Turkish].
- Caliskan, H. & Yildirim, Y., 2020. Developing Effective Citizenship Values Scale for Secondary School Students. *Journal of Milli Egitim*. **49**(228), 335 – 364 [In Turkish].
- Cevik Kansu, C., 2015. *Efficiency of Active Citizenship Education on 4th Grade of Primary Students*. Samsun: Ondokuz Mayıs University [In Turkish].
- Degirmenci, Y. & Eskici, B., 2019. Examination of Prospective Teachers' Perceptions of Active Citizenship. *International Journal of Society Researces*, **11**(18), 232 – 256 [In Turkish].
- Demirhan, E. I., 2018. Sixth Grade Students' Perceptions of Civil Society Organizations. *Journal of Innovative Research in Social Studies*, **1**(1), 11 – 22 [In Turkish].
- Durualp, E., 2016. Investigation of Citizenship Perception of Middle School Students From The Point of Some Sociological Variables. Ankara: Ankara University [In Turkish].
- Ersoy, F., 2014. Active and Democratic Citizenship Education and It's Challenges in Social Studies Classroom. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*, **55**(55), 1 – 20.
- Ersoy, F. A., 2012. Mothers' Perceptions of Citizenship, Practices for Developing Citizenship Conscience of Their Children and Problems They Encountered. *Journal of Educational Sciences: Theory and Practice*, **12**(3), 2111 – 2124 [In Turkish].
- Eryilmaz, E., 2019. *Teachers' Views on The Applicability of The Benchmarks About Effective Citizenship in Social Studies Curriculum*. Ondokuz Mayıs University [In Turkish].
- Eurydice., 2005. *Citizenship Education At School in Europe*. Brussels.
- Evrin, S., 1972. *Introduction to The Problem of Role As A Psychosociological Concept in The Field of Personality*. İstanbul: İstanbul University [In Turkish].
- George, D., 2011. *Spss For Windows Step By Step: A Simple Study Guide and Reference*. Pearson Education India.
- Hablemitoglu, S. & Ozmete, E., 2012. A Suggestion for Effective Citizenship Education. *Ankara Journal of Health Sciences*, **1**(3), 39 – 54 [In Turkish].
- Hair, J. F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J. & Anderson, R. E., 2014. *Multivariate Data Analysis: Pearson New International Edition*. Essex: Pearson Education Limited.
- Hofstede, G., 1991. *Cultures and Organizations-Software of The Mind*. UK: McGraw-Hill Books.
- Hoskins, B., Jesinghaus, J., Mascherini, M. at al., 2006. *Measuring Active Citizenship in Europe*, Institute for The Protection and Security

- of The Citizen*. Luxembourg: Official Publications of the European Communities.
- Jackson, R. (Ed.), 2003. *International Perspectives on Citizenship, Education and Religious Diversity*. Routledge.
- Karasar, N., 2007. *Methods of Scientific Research*. Ankara: Nobel Publishing [In Turkish].
- Kus, Z. & Aksu A., 2017. Social Studies Teachers' Beliefs on Citizenship and Citizenship Education, *International Journal of Turkish Education Sciences*. 2017(8), 18 – 41 [In Turkish].
- Mead, G. H., 1934. *Mind, Self and Society*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Morgan, G. A., Barrett, K. C., Leech, N. L. & Gloeckner, G. W., 2019. *Ibm Spss For Introductory Statistics: Use and Interpretation*. New York: Routledge.
- Morris, P. & Cogan, J., 2001. A Comparative Overview: Civic Education Across Six Societies. *International Journal of Educational Research*, 35(1), 109 – 123.
- Ozturk, C., 2009. *Social Studies: An Interdisciplinary View of Social Life*. Ankara: Pegem Publishing. [In Turkish].
- Ozturk, C. & Otluoğlu, R., 2003. *Literary Products and Written Materials in Social Studies Teaching*. Ankara: Pegem Publishing [In Turkish].
- Pallant, J., 2020. *SPSS Survival Manual: A Step By Step Guide to Data Analysis Using*. New York: Routledge.
- Polat, S. & Caliskan, M., 2013. Examination of Secondary Students' Value Orientations in Terms of Some Variables. *Journal of Uludag University of Education Faculty*, 26(2), 387 – 404.
- Putnam, R. D., 1993. *Making Democracy Work*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.
- Safran, M., 2008. *Look At Social Studies Teaching, Social Studies Teaching With Special Teaching Methods*. Ankara: Pegema Publishing [In Turkish].
- Saracaloglu, A. S., Evin, İ., & Varol, S. R., 2004. A Research That Should Compare The Democratic Attitudes of Teachers and Teacher Candidates Who Conduct Tasks in Various Institutions in Izmir Province. *Journal of Educational Sciences:Theory and Practice*, 4(2), 335 – 363 [In Turkish].
- Scheerens, J., 2011. Indicators on Informal Learning for Active Citizenship At School. *Educational Assessment, Evaluation and Accountability*, 23(3), 201 – 222.
- Scheerens, J., 2009. *Informal Learning of Active Citizenship At School: An International Comparative Study in Seven European Countries*. Springer Science & Business Media.

- Schwartz, S., 1994. Universals in The Contentand Structure of Values: Theoretical Advances and Empirical Tests in 20 Countries. *Advances in Experimental Socila Psychology*, **25**, 1 – 65.
- Shaw, G., 2005. Mapping The Terrain – Values Education and Geography, İnteraction. *Journal of Geography Teachers' Association of Victoria*, **33**(3), 9 – 12.
- Steenekamp, C. & Loubser, R., 2016. Active Citizenship: A Comparative Study of Selected Young and Established Democracies. *Journal of Politikon*, **43**(1), 117 – 134.
- Sener, P., 2019. *Determination of The Cognitive Structures and Concept Perception of Secondary School Students About The Concepts of Effective Citizenship Learning*. Gazi: Gazi University [In Turkish].
- Ulusoy, K. & Dilmac, B., 2012. *Values Education*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi Publishing [In Turkish].
- Vatandas, C., 2007. Perception of Gender and Gender Roles. *İstanbul Journal of Sociological Studies, Sociology Conferences*, **35**, 29 – 56 [In Turkish].
- Yazgan, A. D., 2013. *The Relationship Between The Media Literacy Levels of Teacher Candidates and The Democratic Values of Active Citizenship*. Canakkale: Canakkale Onsekiz Mart University [In Turkish].
- Yildirim, Y., 2019. *The Effect of Outdoor School Activity Based Values Education Programme on Students' Effective Citizenship Values*. Sakarya: Sakarya University [In Turkish].
- Yilmaz, K., 2013. An Investigation Into Elementary School Students' Perceptions of Basic Concepts About Citizenship Education. *Hacettepe University Journal of Faculty of Educational*, **28**(1), 453 – 463 [In Turkish].

✉ **Elif Alkar, PhD student**

ORCID iD: 0000-0002-5048-6470

Tolga Kara, PhD student

ORCID iD: 0000-0002-6563-1693

Prof. Dr. Emin Atasoy

ORCID iD: 0000-0002-6073-6461

Department of Turkish and Social Studies Education

Faculty of Education

Bursa Uludag University

Bursa, Turkey

E-mail: 811771010@ogr.uludag.edu.tr

E-mail: 811771007@ogr.uludag.edu.tr

E-mail: eatasoy@uludag.edu.tr